

W. A. Field Library

10722

[From the Journal of The Presbyterian Historical Society.]

THE
AMERICAN REVISIONS OF
WATTS'S PSALMS.

BY
LOUIS F. BENSON, D. D.



PHILADELPHIA :
THE PRESBYTERIAN HISTORICAL SOCIETY.
1903.

SCP
3408

THE AMERICAN REVISIONS OF WATTS'S "PSALMS."

BY LOUIS F. BENSON, D. D.

In a former paper a study was made of the early editions of Dr. Watts's *Hymns*, and from the successive prefaces to these the progress of his work upon the *The Psalms of David Imitated*, was traced.¹ A subsequent paper contained some notices of the publication of the latter, and incidentally of its reprinting and use in this country.²

This reprinting of Watts's *Psalms* began in 1729 with an issue which was the first book to appear from the "New Printing-Office near The Market," Philadelphia, set up by Benjamin Franklin in partnership with his fellow-workman Hugh Meredith.³ Its publication was not due to any demand from the churches, or even from individuals, at that early date, since we have Franklin's own word that the impression remained upon his shelves unsold. But the demand came, and the extensive use of the *Psalms* in the Colonies is reflected in the large number of American editions. In Philadelphia alone later reprints appeared in 1740, 1741, 1753(?), 1757, 1760, 1778, 1781, and the number published in New England was considerably larger.⁴

But in "accommodating the Book of Psalms to Christian worship," Dr. Watts had not only made "David and Asaph . . . speak the common Sense and Language of a Christian,"⁵ but also that of a loyal citizen of Great Britain and subject of its king. As time passed the use of such language became less

¹ *The JOURNAL*, Vol. I, p. 265.

² *Ibid.*, Vol. I, p. 327.

³ A fac simile of the title-page is in Ford, *The Many-Sided Franklin*. New York, The Century Co., 1899, p. 194.

⁴ The Philadelphia editions appear in Hildeburn's *Issues of the Press in Pennsylvania* (Philadelphia, 1885-86); and of the New England issues there is quite an assemblage in the catalogue of the Brinley sale.

⁵ Preface of 1719.

and less acceptable in the Colonies, and with the establishment of their independence it became impossible. The American reprints of Watts's text intact, therefore, come to an end with the close of the Revolutionary War.¹

Some revision of the text was demanded. In the words of President Dwight: "After the American Revolution it became early the general wish of the Churches and Congregations in this country, that such passages in Dr. Watts's version of the Psalms, as were local, and inapplicable to our own circumstances, might be altered, and made to accord with those circumstances."² The purpose of this paper is to consider the successive revisions undertaken with this end in view, and to discriminate the various editions in which they were embodied.

I.

THE MYCALL REVISION, 1781.

The earliest of these revisions known to the present writer was that printed in Newburyport with the following title:—

[A 1] The | Psalms | of | David, | Imitated in the | Language of
the | New Testament, | and applied to the | Christian State
and Worship. | By I. Watts, D. D. | The fortieth edition,
corrected, | and accommodated to the use of | the Church of
Christ in America. | [texts, 6 ll.] | Newbury-Port: | Printed
and Sold by John Mycall. | MDCCLXXXI. | 16mo.³

The origin of this historic book has happily been recorded by

¹The Philadelphia edition of 1781, above referred to, was printed by Robert Aitken. In view of his patriotism and of what he had suffered at the hands of the British army, it seems curious that the edition should retain all the original references to Great Britain and its king; and equally curious that there was a demand for such an edition in Philadelphia at that date.

²Dwight's Preface to his edition of Watts's *Psalms*.

³With the writer's copy is bound in *The Hymns and Spiritual Songs* of Dr. Watts, by the same printer, 1782; also described as "The fortieth edition, corrected, and accommodated," etc.

President Stiles, under date of December 8th, 1781, as follows:¹—

“This year has been published the fortieth Edition of Dr. Watts’s Psalms: it was printed at Newburyport in Massachusetts by Mr. Mycall, Printer. He² with the Advice & Assist^a of neighbor^s ministers & others, has made some Alterations in Psalms where *G. Britain* is mentioned, & references to the King of Gt. Britain—as in the 75th Psalm. At first it may seem as if these alterations were many: however they really are but few. Thus the Ps. Book is well adapted to the Chh in America.”

This was after the capture of Yorktown, but still nearly two years before the Treaty of Peace. One can readily reproduce in imagination the anxious but fervid consultations of Mr. Mycall’s committee and the scrutiny by approving eyes throughout New England of the results of their patriotic labors. Their book is indeed a precious memorial of the times. Yet one cannot but find his sense of humor appealed to by this patriotic necessity of getting King George well out of King David’s Psalms. Why indeed had he ever got in?

The most striking feature of the text of the Mycall revision is that of Psalm LXXV, which Watts had entitled:—

“*Power and government from God alone.* Apply’d to the Glorious Revolution by King WILLIAM, or the Happy Accession of King GEORGE to the Throne.”

Mycall altered the title to read:—

“Applied to the glorious revolution in *America*, July 4th 1776.”

and the change in the governing powers is set forth in the 2d verse:—

“2. *America* was doom’d a slave,
Her frame dissolv’d, her fears were great;
When God a right’ous council gave,
To bear the pillars of the state.”

¹ *The Literary Diary of Ezra Stiles, D. D., LL. D., President of Yale College.* Edited by Franklin Bowditch Dexter, M. A. New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1901, vol. II, p. 571.

² Mycall had been a schoolmaster until engaging in the printing business. See Isaiah Thomas, *History of Printing in America*; Worcester, 1810; Vol. I, p. 400.

A peculiarity of the text arises from the difficulty of finding a name for the colonies, now freed from that slavery, which is to be substituted for "Great Britain" and the like in the original. Sometimes it is "our States" (XXI), "These ransom'd States" (XLVII), "ye rescu'd States" (LXVII); now "New England" (LX); and now "America" (LXXV), or "Columb'a" (CXLVII).

It would be a mistake to assume that Mycall's revision was merely a temporary makeshift, to be altogether superseded by the authorized revisions. Such was not the case. That it met with approval President Stiles is witness, and that the approval continued, and brought it into extended use we have the conclusive testimony of subsequent reprints. Of these the following have been met with by the writer:—

[A 2] The Psalms of David, Imitated in the Language of the New Testament, And applied to the Christian State and Worship. By I. Watts, D. D. Boston: Printed by Peter Edes, for J. Boyle. . . . MDCCLXXXVII. 16mo.

[A 3] [Same Title.] Boston: Printed by John W. Folsom, for¹ No. 30, Union-Street. MDCCLXXXIX. 16mo. (Watts's *Hymns* are bound in.)

(There is nothing on the title page of A 2 or A 3 to suggest that the "accommodated" text is used.)

[A 4] The Psalms of David. Imitated, &c. Corrected, and accommodated to the use of the Church of Christ in America. Brookfield, Massachusetts. Printed by E. Merriam & Co. . . . October 1802. 24mo. (Watts's *Hymns* are bound in.)

[A 5] [Same Title.] Same printer. n. d. [but said in the Brinley Catalogue to be of 1804.] 24mo. (Watts's *Hymns* are bound in.)

(There are slight divergencies of text in this edition.)

[A 6] [Same Title.] Same printer. 1812. 24mo. (Watts's *Hymns* are bound in.)

¹ There is evidently an omission here.

II.

BARLOW'S REVISION, 1785.

The first authorized revision of Watts's *Psalms* was made under a resolution of the General Association of Connecticut passed in June, 1784. The occasion and the method of this revision are set forth in the official certificate printed in the book itself when published :—

“At a meeting of the General Association of the State of Connecticut in June last, it was thought expedient, that a number of the Psalms in Dr. Watts's version, which are locally appropriated, should be altered and applied to the state of the Christian Church in general, and not to any particular country ; and finding some attempts had been made to alter and apply those Psalms to America, or particular parts of America, tending to destroy that uniformity in the use of Psalmody, so desireable in religious assemblies ; they appointed the Rev. Messrs. *Timothy Pitkin*, *John Smally* and *Theodore Hinsdale*, a Committee to confer with and apply to Mr. *Joel Barlow*, of Hartford, to make the proposed alterations.

“These, together with the additions and the collection of Hymns annexed to this Edition, we have carefully examined and approved ; and we therefore recommend them to the use of the Church of Christ, for the purposes of public worship and private devotion.

“TIMOTHY PITKIN,	}	Committee of Gen. Association.
“JOHN SMALLY,		
“THEODORE HINSDALE,		

“The following gentlemen, appointed by particular Associations, to examine and revise, concur in the above recommendation.

“NATHAN WILLIAMS,
“THOMAS W. BRAY,
“NATHAN PERKINS.”

This certificate appears without date in the first edition of Barlow's revision ; but in the third it bears date “January 1, 1785.”

In a preface of his own, immediately following this certificate, Barlow explains the revision from his point of view. After paying a high tribute to the general excellence of Watts's version, and explaining the difficulty of the task of revision, he continues :—

"Were it not for his local appropriation of some Psalms, and his omission of a few others, his Version would doubtless have been used for many ages without amendment. But as the author of these corrections is employed, directed and supported by so respectable a Body as the whole Clergy of the State; and as it is an object of great importance that harmony and uniformity should be established as extensively as possible in the use of Psalmody, he has not only avoided all local applications, but has made some slighter corrections in point of elegance, where the rules of grammar, established since the time of Doctor Watts have made it necessary.

"The Psalms considerably altered are the 21st, 60th, 67th, 75th, 124th, 147th; those omitted by Doctor Watts are the 28th, 43d, 52d, 54th, 59th, 64th, 70th, 79th, 88th, 108th, 137th, 140th.

"The Hymns are selected chiefly from Doctor Watts: some are entirely new. It was thought advisable to bind them in the same volume, that sacramental and other particular occasions, not provided for in the Book of Psalms, might be supplied with suitable songs of devotion."

As regards the spirit in which this revision was made it will be noticed that it differs from that of Mycall's. In the earlier one the motive was to change Dr. Watts's "local appropriations" and to apply them to "the States" or to "New England" in a spirit of rival patriotism. In this revision, on the other hand, the motive was to rid the Psalms of all "local appropriations" and have them "applied to the state of the Christian Church in general." And it must be said that this spirit was faithfully carried out, even the original appropriation by Dr. Watts of "Psalm cvii. *Last Part*," as "A Psalm for New-England" being ignored in Barlow's version.

The selection of Barlow to make the revision was a very natural one. He was a son of Connecticut and a graduate of Yale in the class of '78. In 1784 he was in his 30th year, and had served for three years as chaplain in the Revolutionary army, though rather as affording a means of livelihood and an opportunity for study than from any sense of a call to the ministry.¹ His whole bent was toward the literary life, and already he was recognized as a man of poetical gifts. He had been chosen from among his class to give the graduation poem, and

¹Barlow was licensed to preach by the New Haven East Association in 1780. See *Contributions to the Ecclesiastical History of Connecticut*, New Haven, 1861, page 324.

was known to be revolving in his mind the scheme of an extensive poetical work.

There were, however, two respects in which Barlow would appear to have exceeded his instructions: (1st) in appending a collection of hymns to the Psalm versions (with this we are not especially concerned); and (2d) in making a textual revision of the original from the point of view of style and grammar. To this latter point we shall have to return, as it had some bearing upon the results.

(1) THE CONNECTICUT GROUP OF EDITIONS.

Barlow's revision was published at Hartford in 1785, with the following title:—

[B 1] Doctor Watts's | Imitation | of the | Psalms | of | David, |
corrected and enlarged. | By Joel Barlow. | To which is
added | A Collection of | Hymns; | The whole applied to
the State of the Christian | Church in General | [text]. |
Hartford: | Printed by Barlow and Babcock: |
M,DCC,LXXXV. |

The volume is a narrow 16mo, of some 350 pages, not ill-printed but having a poor appearance on account of the quality of the paper. Barlow had taken up his residence in Hartford, had established, in connection with a local craftsman, Elisha Babcock, "a new printing-office near the State-House," and had begun the publication of a weekly newspaper.¹ By this new firm the publication of the book, not unnaturally, was undertaken.

The printing of the book by Barlow himself suggests an understanding with the General Association that it be published at his personal risk or profit; an arrangement likely to be acceptable to that fondness for commercial venture he showed through all his career. Both Griswold and Duyckinck state that Barlow gave up the publication of his newspaper in order to open a bookstore in Hartford "to dispose of the literary wares which he had now on hand, the Psalm Book and the Vision,"

¹See *Life and Letters of Joel Barlow, LL. D., Poet, Statesman, Philosopher*, by Charles Burr Todd, New York: Putnam's, 1886, p. 46.

which store "he closed when he had accomplished his purpose, and began the practice of the law."¹ This incident, whether authentic or otherwise, is at least passed over by Barlow's biographer.

The other members of the original group, or what may be called the Connecticut group, of editions were as follows :—

[B 2] [Same Title] The Second Edition. Hartford : for Hudson & Goodwin and Nathaniel Patten. n. d. [1786]. 24mo.

[B 3] [Same Title] The Third Edition. Hartford : Printed by Nathaniel Patten. [With the Privilege of Copy-Right.] n. d. [1787]. 24mo.

[B 4] [Same Title] The Fourth Edition. Hartford : for Hudson & Goodwin and N. Patten. n. d. [1790]. 24mo.

Barlow also printed in a separate form his original contributions to the work, entitled :—

[B 5] A Translation of Sundry Psalms which were omitted in Doctor Watts's Version ; To which is added a Number of Hymns. The whole contained in the New Edition of Psalms and Hymns. By Joel Barlow. Hartford : 1785.²

In this group may also be included a reprint :—

[B 6] [Same Title as A 1] Glasgow : Printed by David Niven ; for James Duncan, Bookseller, Trongate, MDCCLXXXVI. 16mo.

(Under what auspices it was made is not known to the writer, but copies frequently turn up in this country. It belongs to this group because reproducing the original title of Barlow's revision, the authorization certificate of the

¹*Cyclopedia of American Literature*, by Evert A. and George L. Duyckinck, New York, 1855, Vol. I, p. 392. See, also, a similar statement in *The Poets and Poetry of America*, by Rufus Wilmot Griswold (16th ed.), Philadelphia, 1855, p. 57.

²There is a copy in the possession of the Massachusetts Historical Society. Its librarian, Dr. Green, informs the writer that Psalm LXIV, a version of which appeared in Barlow's revision, is not included here, as by Barlow himself.

Connecticut Association, the collection of Hymns, and also Barlow's preface. These features would seem to imply that it was printed for importation into this country and use in the Connecticut churches.)

In this group we must also include a New York issue:—

[B 7] Doctor Watts's Imitation of the Psalms of David corrected and enlarged, by Joel Barlow. Adapted to the State of the Christian Church in General. New York, Printed by W. Durell. . . . M,DCC,XCI. 24mo.

(It omits the hymns from the book and the mention of them from the title page. Its peculiar feature is that it is the only issue known to the writer, beyond those just referred to, which bears the title Barlow originally gave to his revision, "Dr. Watts's Imitation," etc. The title page follows typographically the original one, but the authorization and Barlow's preface are omitted, and the short preface much used in the groups here lettered C and D is substituted. In actual intent and use this issue no doubt belongs among those latter groups.)¹

(2) DISTINCTIVELY PRESBYTERIAN EDITIONS.

In the year in which Barlow's revision first appeared, at the sessions of the Synod of New York and Philadelphia the question of collating the existing psalm versions with a view to "compose for us a version more suitable to our circumstances and taste than any we yet have," was referred to a committee.² In 1787, possibly in consequence of that action, "the Synod

¹The writing in this copy determines one of the localities in which this edition was used. It contains on a fly-leaf a note in a contemporary hand that "Jane Hughes Departed this Life Tewsday 26 of November 1799 and was Buried in Deeprun buriing ground the Thursday following And Mr. Dubois preact her Funeral Sermon." In a repetition of the note he appears as "Revd Uriah Dubois." There is also the signature, "Christopher Wigton his hand and pen 1799." The Rev. Uriah Dubois was installed pastor of Deep Run and Tincin October 10, 1798. (See Roll of Ministers and Licentiates of the Presbytery of Philadelphia, by W. M. Rice, D. D., in Nevin's *History of the Presbytery of Philadelphia*, etc., Philadelphia, 1888.)

²Records, pp. 513, 514.

did allow, and do hereby allow, that Dr. Watts's imitation of David's Psalms, as revised by Mr. Barlow, be sung in the churches and families under their care."¹

This action created a demand that seems to have been eager and instant, and was likewise long continued, for new issues of Barlow's *Watts*. Beginning, therefore, in the year of Synod's allowance, and continuing well toward the middle of the nineteenth century, we have a special group of distinctively Presbyterian editions. They are characterized by three features:—

(1.) The omission of the hymns originally appended to the psalm-versions. The hymns plainly were not considered as included within the terms of Synod's action.

(2.) The adoption of a distinctive title for the book, from which the names of Dr. Watts and of Mr. Barlow alike disappear. The version is introduced in Presbyterian churches as "Psalms Carefully Suited to the Christian Worship in the United States of America. Being An Improvement of the old Versions of the Psalms of David." As the certificate of the stated clerk of Synod appears in the original edition of 1787 so entitled, it is more than probable that the title was fixed upon after consultation and with official approval. The title, however, failed to express the spirit of the Barlow revision, which was precisely the opposite to that of an adaptation to local use in the United States or elsewhere: to get rid, in other words, of all traces of local adaptations of the Psalms.

(3) The setting forth upon the title page of the authorization of the book, in the following words:—"Allowed, by the reverend Synod of New-York and Philadelphia, to be used in churches and private families." This was originally, and often thereafter, supplemented by a certificate, as follows:—

"PHILADELPHIA, *May 24th, 1787.*

"THE Synod of New-York and Philadelphia did allow Dr. Watts's Imitation of David's Psalms, as revised by Mr. Barlow, to be sung in the churches and families under their care.

"Extracted from the records of Synod, by

"GEORGE DUFFIELD, *D. D.,*

"Stated Clerk of Synod."

¹ Records, p. 535.

From these avowedly Presbyterian editions, the original authorization by the General Association of Connecticut was, of course, omitted, and, also, Mr. Barlow's preface; the place of the latter being generally supplied by a briefer one commending the work of Dr. Watts and the revision of Mr. Barlow.

A complete list of these Presbyterian editions could not at present be made. Like most other classes of hymn-books they have, until recent years, been lightly esteemed by collectors, carelessly disposed of, or, if kept, indifferently recorded. The writer will content himself with a record of such only as he has been enabled to gather together:—

[C 1] Psalms, carefully suited to the Christian Worship in the United States of America. Being An Improvement of the Old Versions of the Psalms of David. Allowed, by the reverend Synod of New York and Philadelphia, to be used in churches and private families. [text]. Philadelphia: Printed by Francis Bailey, at Yorick's Head, in Market Street. MDCCLXXXVII. 16mo.

[C 2] [Same Title] Same printer and date. 32mo.

[Bound up with this edition and having the same imprint, is a collection of 139 hymns, with the title "Hymns suited to the Christian Worship in the United States of America." It opens with one of John Wesley's translations and is altogether of unusual character for the period. The writer has met with no other edition and cannot account for its presence in this connection.]

[C 3] [Same Title] Philadelphia: Printed by W. Young and J. James, in Chestnut Street. M. DCC. LXXXVIII. 24mo.
(Watts's *Hymns*, Philadelphia: Joseph Crukshank, 1787, bound in.) Certificate of Stated Clerk omitted.
[James Craft's copy, 1790, with MS. index and hymns inserted.]

[C 4] [Same Title] New Brunswick: Printed by Shelly Arnett, 1789. 16mo.

[Isaac Bower's copy, 1st mo. 7th, 1791.]

[C 5] [Same Title] New York: Hodge, Allen & Campbell, MDCCXC. 24mo.

[C 6] [Same Title] Elizabeth-Town: Printed by Shepard Kollock, M. DCC. XCI. 24mo.

- [C 7] [Same Title] Philadelphia : Printed by Francis Bailey, No. 116, High-street. M, DCC, XCII. 24mo.
- [C 8] [Same Title] New York : Printed for Berry and Rogers, and John Reid. M. DCC. XCII. 24mo.
- [C 9] [Same Title] Philadelphia : Printed for, & Sold by H. & P. Rice, Market-street. 1793. 24mo.
[The second issue to omit certificate of Stated Clerk.]
- [C 10] [Same Title] Philadelphia : Printed for and sold by R. Campbell. South Second Street. 1795. 24mo.
- [C 11] [Same Title] Philadelphia : Printed by Francis Bailey, at Yorick's Head, No. 116, High-street. M. DCC. XCV. 32mo. [No allowance on title, but with the certificate.]
- [C 12] [Same Title] Elizabeth-Town : Printed by Shepard Kollock for T. Allen . . . New-York. M, DCC, XCVII. 24mo. (Watts's *Hymns* bound in.)
- [C 13] Psalms, carefully suited, &c. Being Dr. Watts' Imitation of the Psalms of David, as improved by Mr. Barlow. Allowed by the Reverend Synod of New-York and Philadelphia, to be sung in Congregations and Families. Philadelphia : Printed for Robert Campbell, No. 32, Chestnut-Street. M, DCC, XCIX. 24mo. (Watts's *Hymns* bound in.)
[The first Presbyterian issue to vary the accepted title; and without the certificate.]
- [C 14] [Same Title as C 13] Philadelphia : Printed and sold by John M'Culloch, No. 1. North Third-street. n. d. (but advertisement dated July, 1802). 24mo. [Without the certificate.]
- [C 15] [Same Title as C 1] Philadelphia : Printed by R. Aitken, No. 20, North Third Street. 1802. 24mo. [With the certificate.]
- [C 16] Dr. Watts' Imitation of the Psalms of David, suited to the Christian Worship, in the United States; and allowed by the Synod of New-York and Philadelphia, to be used in all the churches. Philadelphia : Printed and Published by William F. M'Laughlin, No. 28, North Second street. 1805. 24mo. (Watts's *Hymns* bound in: without the certificate.)

(In this edition Barlow's additions and some of his more important revisions are retained, but many of Watts's lines and the whole of his Psalm XXI (C. M.) are restored. Hence the change in the title.)

[C 17] An Imitation of the Psalms of David: carefully suited to the Christian Worship: being an Improvement of the former versions of the Psalms. Allowed by the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in the United States, to be used in churches and private families. Albany: Printed by Websters and Skinners, at their Bookstore, in the White House, corner of State and Pearl Streets, 1813. 16mo. (Watts's *Hymns* bound in.)

(The latest avowedly Presbyterian Edition that has come under the writer's notice. It is possibly unique in claiming the allowance of the General Assembly for the use of Barlow's revision.)

(3) EDITIONS APPEARING AS "PSALMS CAREFULLY SUITED,"
ETC., BUT NOT AS DISTINCTIVELY PRESBYTERIAN.

Beginning at least as early as 1793, and running parallel with the avowedly Presbyterian issues and beyond them, was a series of editions which adopted the distinctive "Psalms carefully suited," etc., of the Presbyterian title page and differing from them merely by the omission both of Synod's allowance and the certificate of its stated clerk. This was, perhaps, but a trade expedient, originally, to extend the circulation of a book proved to be popular. The omission of the Synodical allowance would not affect the use of these editions within the Presbyterian Church, and encouraged their use outside of its bounds. Many of them, no doubt, were principally intended for Presbyterian use, the continued reprinting of the original allowance becoming less necessary as the years passed.

The following issues, among many, may be mentioned because at hand:—

[D 1] Psalms, carefully suited to the Christian Worship in the United States of America. Being an Improvement of the Old Versions of the Psalms of David. [text] Philadel-

- phia : Printed by W. Young, No. 52, Second Street, the corner of Chestnut-street. M,DCC,XCIII. 48mo.
- [D 2] [Same Title] Same printer. M,DCC,XCIV. 12mo.
- [D 3] [Same Title] Same printer. M,DCC,XCIX. 12mo. (Watts's *Hymns* bound in.)
- [D 4] [Same Title] New York : Printed and sold by T. & J. Swords, No 160 Pearl-street. 1804. 32mo. (Watts's *Hymns* bound in)
- [D 5] [Same Title] Philadelphia : Thomas Dobson, at the Stone House, No. 41, South Second Street. 1805. (Watts's *Hymns* bound in.) 16mo.
[Sarah Miller's copy.]
- [D 6] Psalms carefully suited, &c. Being Dr. Watts's Imitation of the Psalms of David, as improved by Mr. Barlow. To this edition are added the words of sundry anthems. Wilmington, (Del.) Peter Brynberg, 1805. 24mo. (Watts's *Hymns* bound in.)
- [D 7] [Same Title as D 1] New York : Williams and Whiting, At their Theological and Classical Book-Store, No. 118 Pearl-street. 1810. 32mo.
- [D 8] [Same Title] New-Brunswick : Ambrose Walker, 1810. 16mo.
- [D 9] [Same Title] Brooklyn, Thomas Kirk, 1811. 32mo.
- [D 10] [Same Title] Philadelphia : W. W. Woodward, 1814. 32mo.
- [D 11] [Same Title] Same printer, 1816. 32mo.
- [D 12] [Same Title] Same printer, 1817. 8vo.
- [D 13] Psalms carefully suited, &c. Being Dr. Watts's Imitation of the Psalms of David, improved. Wilmington : Robert Porter, 1818. 32mo.
- [D 14] [Same Title as D 1] Geneva, N. Y., James Bogert, 1819. 24mo.
- [D 15] Psalms, carefully suited, &c. Being an Improvement of the Old Version of the Psalms of David. By I. Watts, D. D. Charleston, S. C., Wm. Riley, 125 Church-street, 1827. 8vo.
(Described in the half-title as "Charleston Edition.")

[D 16] [Same Title as D 1] New York: Betts and Anstice, MDCCCXXXIII. 16mo.

(The last nine editions have Dr. Watts's *Hymns* bound in.)

(4) THE "CORRECTED" EDITIONS.

A final series of editions of Barlow's revision needs mention. These begin as early as 1812, and consist in each case of the *Psalms* and *Hymns* bound together in one volume, each with its own title, and each described thereon as "corrected." This constitutes the only variance in the title of the *Psalms*, and there appears to be little variance in the text. The corrections are rather in the line of restorations of verses or even whole versions of Psalms as given by Watts, but which Barlow had chosen to omit. In some editions a brief "Life of Watts" is included. The following are the examples at hand:—

[E 1] *Psalms* carefully suited, &c. A new edition, corrected. New Brunswick. Printed by Lewis Deare for D. Fenton, Trenton. 1812. 12mo.

[E 2] [Same Title] N. Y., Tiebout & Sons, 1817. 12mo.

[E 3] [Same Title] N. Y., Daniel D. Smith, 1824. 12mo.

[E 4] [Same Title] Princeton, N. J., D. A. Borrenstein, 1827. 12mo.

[E 5] [Same Title] Same printer, 1828. 12mo.

III.

THE WORCESTER EDITION, 1786.

In the year following the publication of Barlow's *Watts*, Isaiah Thomas, the enterprising and patriotic printer of Worcester, issued a complete edition of Watts's *Psalms* and *Hymns* in one volume, printed in double columns. For this he made free use of Barlow's revision, but at the same time established a text and arrangement of his own, calling his issue "The First Worcester Edition:—"

[F 1] *The Psalms of David, imitated In the Language of the New-Testament, and Applied to the Christian State and Worship. Together with Hymns . . . With Indexes and*

Tables complete. By Isaac Watts, D. D. The First Worcester Edition. [texts]. Printed at Worcester, Massachusetts, by Isaiah Thomas, And sold at his Book-Store : Sold also by the Booksellers in Boston.—MDCCLXXXVI. 12mo.

The book is based upon Watts's own editions, the three quotations on the English title-page appearing in full on the title of this, Watts's "Advertisement to the Readers" being given; but Barlow's revisions are introduced into the text in so far as they commended themselves. The new Psalms contributed by Barlow do not appear in the body of the work, but in an "Appendix," preceded by a note specifying the Psalms omitted by Watts and continuing :—

"The following, written by the ingenious Mr. Joel Barlow of Connecticut, by desire of the General Association of that State, are here added in order to accommodate those who wish to have the Psalms complete. They are extracted from a Book intitled 'Dr. Watts's Imitation of the Psalms of David corrected and enlarged.'"

The Worcester text has other ear-marks, such as the omission of the C. M. version of Psalm XXI and the emphasizing of verses and even single words quoted from Barlow's version by quotation marks and sometimes by italics as well, as in Psalms LX, LXXV, and CXLVII. This has a curious effect until the reason for it is grasped.

[F 2] [Same Title, omitting "First Worcester Edition."] Printed at Boston, by I. Thomas and E. T. Andrews, Faust's Statue, No. 45, Newbury Street. MDCCXCI. 12mo.

(A page-for-page reprint of F 1 up to the final index, the type of which is enlarged.)

[F 3] The Psalms of David Imitated, &c. Boston : From the Press of J. Bumstead, for John Boyle. . . . M.DCC.XCII 16mo.

(The Worcester text of Watts, without the Appendix of Barlow's additions. The make up of the book, like the title, is in the usual (not the Worcester) form. There are also 1794 and 1795 Bumstead imprints, perhaps of the same character.)

[F 4] The Psalms of David Imitated, &c. Exeter : Printed by

John Lamson, for Mess. Thomas and Andrews. . . . 1794, 24mo.

(Apparently based on F 1 or F 2, though differing in the title, and occasionally, in a slight degree, in the text; e. g., in Psalm LXVII. The Appendix is also dropped. It, however, reproduces the misprint of "natives" for "navies" in Psalm XLVIII, 5, which occurs in both F 1 and F 2. The double column and the other typographical features of the Worcester edition are departed from.)

[F 5] [Same Title as F 2] Printed at Northampton, by William Butler. MDCCXCIX. 12mo.

(An accurate reproduction of the typographical features and the text of F 1 or F 2, including the misprint "natives.")

[F 6] [Same Title as F 2, omitting reference to Tables, &c.] Keene, [N. H.] Printed by and for John Prentiss. . . . 1803. 12mo.

(A reproduction of the Worcester text and typographical features, but without the Appendix. The misprint disappears from Psalm XLVIII, 5.)

IV.

DR. DWIGHT'S REVISION, 1801.

(1) ITS PUBLICATION.

In 1797 the project of a second authorized revision of Watts's *Psalms* took definite shape. In June of that year the General Association of Connecticut requested President Dwight "to revise Dr. Watts's imitation of the Psalms of David, so as to accommodate them to the state of the American Churches; and to supply the deficiency of those Psalms which Dr. Watts had omitted."¹

In 1798 this action was reported to the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church by its delegates to the Connecticut Association.² According to Dr. Dwight, a motion was made in

¹ Certificate prefixed to Dwight's Edition of *Watts*.

² *Minutes of the General Assembly, 1789-1820*, p. 139.

the Assembly at that time "for accomplishing the same general purpose; but the General Assembly, being informed, that the business had been taken up by the General Association, concluded to postpone any further measures, relative to it, until they should see the issue of the measures, adopted in Connecticut."¹ Dr. Dwight gave notice to the General Association at their meeting in 1799 that he had completed his "alterations and additions."² The Association wished "the advice and concurrence of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in the United States in this important business,"³ and doubtless so informed that body. In 1800 the Assembly elected a committee to meet a like committee of the Association in June of that year at Stamford to examine the revisions and additions made by Dr. Dwight. The committee was directed to report the result to the next General Assembly.⁴ On the 10th day of June the joint committee met, and they signed a certificate in which they "approve and recommend said version, as thus altered and amended, to the use of the Churches."⁵ In May, 1801, the Assembly's committee reported to that body that they had carefully examined, and approved "with some amendments," Dr. Dwight's revision, and "that these joint committees unanimously advised Dr. Dwight to add a number of hymns, selected out of Dr. Watts's and Dr. Doddridge's hymns, with some few of Dr. Rippon's, to enlarge the system of Psalmody, and have the whole printed as soon as convenient, for the use of the churches." Whereupon it was resolved that "the Assembly do not think it advisable to express their approbation of any system of Psalmody without its having been first submitted to their inspection and review."⁶

Dr. Dwight's revision appeared that year (1801) at Hartford

¹ Dr. Dwight's "Advertisement" prefixed to his edition. No such action appears in the *Minutes*.

² The Certificate.

³ *Ibid.*

⁴ *Minutes*, p. 202.

⁵ The Certificate.

⁶ *Minutes*, pp. 216-217.

in a narrow 24mo volume of 600 pages. Prefixed was the certificate of the joint-committee recommending it to the use of the churches.¹ This was followed by Dr. Dwight's "advertisement," covering more than three pages, and dated "New Haven, August 13, 1800." The title page is as follows :

[G 1] The | Psalms of David, | imitated in the language of |
 the New Testament, | and applied to the | Christian use
 and worship | By I. Watts, D. D. | A new edition, | in
 which the Psalms, omitted by Dr. Watts, | are versified, |
 local passages are altered, and | a number of Psalms are
 versified anew, | in proper metres. | By Timothy Dwight,
 D. D. | President of Yale-College. | At the Request of the
 General Association of | Connecticut. | To the Psalms is
 added | A Selection of Hymns. | Hartford : | Printed by
 Hudson and Goodwin. | 1801. |

On the reverse of the title are the words, "PUBLISHED ACCORDING TO ACT OF CONGRESS." In some later imprints the notice appears more fully, showing that the book was entered for copyright by Dr. Dwight "on the thirteenth day of November, in the twenty-sixth year of the Independence of the United States of America" [1801]. The "Selection of Hymns" is not an appendix, but made an integral part of the book by continuous paging. It has, however, a title page of its own, reading:—

"Hymns selected from Dr. Watts, Dr. Doddridge, and various other writers. According to the Recommendation of the Joint Committee of the General Association of Connecticut, and the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in America, By Timothy Dwight, President of Yale-College. Hartford: Printed by Hudson and Goodwin. 1801."

In 1802 the General Assembly appointed a committee "to examine the system of Psalms and Hymns published agreeably to a recommendation of a joint committee of the General Association of Connecticut and the General Assembly, and to

¹The refusal of the Assembly of 1801 to do this very thing seems to make plain that the Presbyterian section of the joint-committee had exceeded its authority.

report to this house whether, in their opinion, this Assembly ought to allow said system of Psalms and Hymns to be used in churches and private families."¹ Later, in the same session, the committee reported, and the Assembly took action, authorizing the use of Dr. Watts's *Hymns* in the congregations, and also "cheerfully allowed" the revision of Dr. Dwight with its appended hymns.²

(2) THE MOVEMENT TO DISPLACE BARLOW'S REVISION.

Both the certificate and advertisement of Dr. Dwight's edition are silent as to the earlier revision made under the same auspices, and yet they make very evident that Dr. Dwight had been commissioned to do over again just what Barlow had already done. Every circumstance points toward the conclusion that the new revision had been undertaken for the purpose of displacing the earlier one. We have then to seek for some explanation of the need or even propriety of this new revision.

Such an explanation has been offered recently by Moses Coit Tyler, the well-known historian of Early American Literature, in his *Three Men of Letters*.³ Having quoted the title page of Dr. Dwight's revision, he goes on to say:—

"This well-packed title-page is the placid record of an ecclesiastical scandal and tragedy. In 1785, precisely the same revision of Dr. Watts's psalm-book had been made by Joel Barlow, under the sanction of the same high authority, and had been issued by the same publishing house. The book had given universal satisfaction, until poor Joel went over to France, and dabbled in the French Revolution, and fell, as was supposed, into all manner of French impiety and abomination. Of course, the saints of Connecticut could not be expected to enjoy any longer the psalms and hymns of the great sinner of Paris; and the task of President Dwight, as recorded on the above title-page, was really to demephitize and disinfect the book; it was to cast out of it all the writings of Joel, and to put into it, in their stead, as many as possible of the writings of Timothy."

¹ *Minutes*, p. 236.

² *Ibid.*, p. 249.

³ New York: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1895; pp. 98-99.

Barlow's biographer puts the matter somewhat differently :—

“Barlow's version was well received by the New England churches, and was in constant use among them until rumors of the poet's lapse from orthodoxy in France became so rife that it was discarded for one prepared by Dr. Dwight. The work, however, did not escape criticism. The changes of expression, the ‘improvements’ on Watts, and the verbal alterations in the text were regarded with suspicion by the more rigid, and the author was declared to have taken unwarrantable liberties with the word of God.”¹

It will be observed that these explanations agree in assigning a single cause for the displacement of Barlow's revision, viz. : disapprobation of the course pursued by him in France, though describing that course in different terms. They appear to agree also in their estimate of the use to which Barlow's book attained in New England. But in regard to the welcome accorded it when first published they differ so much as to be incompatible.

(1) To begin at the reception of Barlow's revision,—Tyler's statement is that it “had given universal satisfaction”; Todd's that it was well received, but did not escape criticism, for reasons given by him. The former statement is not true at all, and even the latter is possibly somewhat under the true level of the facts.

Confining ourselves now to Connecticut, it is quite plain that from the very beginning Barlow's revision was received with considerable dissatisfaction. The evidence of this is the more convincing because not confined to a single type of witness. Miss Caulkins, in her *History of Norwich*, relates an incident concerning Oliver Arnold, a roving rhymist, with a peculiar gift for making extemporaneous verses :—

“In a bookseller's shop in New Haven, Oliver Arnold was introduced to Joel Barlow, who had just then acquired considerable notoriety by the publication of an altered edition of Watts' Psalms and Hymns. Barlow asked for a specimen of his talent; upon which the wandering poet immediately repeated the following stanza :—

¹*Life and Letters of Joel Barlow*, by Charles Burr Todd, New York, 1886; pp. 49-50.

“ ‘ You’ve proved yourself a sinful cre’tur’ ;
 You’ve murdered Watts, and spoilt the metre ;
 You’ve tried the Word of God to alter,
 And for your pains deserve a halter.’ ”¹

Something of tradition may mingle with sober narrative in this incident, but one cannot doubt that it embodies the situation as seen by the eyes of plain people.

There is testimony, also, from the other end of the scale of culture and influence. Under date of April 18th, 1785, President Stiles made this entry in his diary :—

“ Mr. Joel Barlow sent me a copy of his Edition of Dr. Watts’s Psalms 1784, corrected by himself at the Direction of the General Association of this State of Connecticut. It was necessary there sh^d have been a few Alterations in passages respects the King, Britain & America. But Mr. Barlow has left out & made anew whole Stanzas, and even Psalms. He has subjoyned Hymns, an indiscriminate Mixture of his own & Dr. Watts. In the place of the Author in the Title page he has put ‘ By Joel Barlow.’ Dr. Watts stiled his an Imitation of Davids Psalms. Mr. Barlow has *corrected* so much as to assume the *Place* of the Author, as if he was the Author. I think he has corrected too much and unnecessarily mutilated the Book & sometimes hurt the poetry. Again such Reverence is due to the Authenty of Authors as that the Index expurgatorius should have been inserted by itself, that we might at one view be able to know what is Wattsian & what is Barlowan ; for as the matter is now Barlow has mounted up at one Leap to all the Glory of Watts. This is a new way of Elevation of Genius & Acquest of Honor. It is but for an adventurous Muse to play the same Correction (for some or no reason) on *Milton* as Mr. Ross has done on President Burr’s Grammar, and Milton becomes the Property of the new Poet. Let a Philosopher throw out some less useful Paragraphs from Newton’s Principia, & insert some of his own and entitle it ‘ Newton’s Principia, By Martin.’ ”

“ Dr. Watts left out twelve Psalms because then already in his Hymns. Mr. Barlow might have transferred these, & this Composition might be still Dr. Watts’s. He has greatly altered 21, 60, 67, 75, 124, 147th Psalms.

“ Mr. Barlow is an excellent Poet ; yet he cannot retoutch Watts to advantage.”²

Dr. Stiles was not inimical to his old scholar and was apparently unmoved by some of the prejudices that stirred the

¹ *History of Norwich, Connecticut*, by Frances Manwaring Caulkins. Published by the Author, n. p., 1866 ; p. 415.

² *The Literary Diary of Ezra Stiles*, New York, 1901, Vol. III, pp. 155, 156.

plain people. But he thought that Barlow had overdone his work, and in doing it had exalted himself at the expense of Dr. Watts. We may be quite sure that Dr. Stiles stood for many, both in his loyalty to Dr. Watts and in his feeling for the proprieties.

(2) Passing now from the original reception of Barlow's revision to the measure of use attained by it,—Tyler rests upon the generality that it gave "universal satisfaction," which certainly was not the case. Todd claims that it "was in constant use" among "the New England churches." Of this there is no evidence, but much to the contrary. Barlow's revision was published, as we have seen, at Hartford, in 1785, and within five years four editions in all appeared there in quick succession. This implies certainly a considerable use in Connecticut churches. But, on the other hand, the Connecticut group comes to an abrupt end in 1790 (or in 1791, if we include the three outlying issues); and our record of editions gathered fails to show a single instance in which Barlow's revision was reprinted in any other New England State. His materials are, however, used more or less freely in Worcester, Boston and other New England editions of Watts; in some cases, as we have seen, his original contributions being appended in full with his name as author. Now these facts do not suggest a general use in "the New England churches" of Barlow's revision, discontinued on account of developed animosity toward its author, or for any other reason. They seem to show that its use in New England had never spread much beyond the Connecticut churches.

What our record shows plainly enough is that the real popularity and the only lasting use gained by Barlow's revision were curiously enough, among the Presbyterians. Of this a study of the imprints furnishes in itself ample evidence. To this Presbyterian use of *Barlow* there will be need to refer more particularly.

(3) In regard to the occasion of the movement to displace Barlow's book,—both Tyler and Todd are agreed in finding it in the ill reputation gained by Barlow in France. But it should not be overlooked that the original dissatisfaction with the free-

handed way in which Barlow had dealt with Watts's text still remained, and would in itself afford explanation enough of the movement. That such dissatisfaction was one of the actual causes leading up to the new revision appears plainly in Dr. Dwight's own advertisement. He speaks of the reverence felt toward Dr. Watts in this country as great, and of his own effort to "vary as little as might be from my original."¹ He also states that he had been "originally cautioned to make no alterations, except those, which should appear to be either absolutely necessary or plainly important." This apologetic tone reflects a public demand for the restoration of Watts's own text, and the instructions to the reviser here alluded to show a purpose corresponding to the demand.

It is, however, beyond question that a very strong tide of feeling against Barlow himself had arisen to supplement the dissatisfaction with his work. He had gone abroad in 1788 as agent of the Scioto Land Company, and, however ignorant he may have been of the disreputable character of that enterprise, his reputation suffered severely in its collapse and exposure. Going then to France, Barlow identified himself with republicanism conspicuously, and became detested by the Federalists at home.² In 1799 John Adams, in a letter, refers to his "blackness of heart," saying, "Tom Paine is not a more worthless fellow."³ The rumor that Barlow had renounced the Christian religion was freely circulated and generally believed by religious people. An alleged letter from him announcing atheistical principles was circulated about 1795. In 1808 his old friend, Noah

¹ "Such was the strength of the torrent of public opinion amongst us, in favor of the *imitation, errors and all*, that even the President of *Yale College* dared to correct only a *part* of these."—Gilbert McMaster, *An Apology for the Book of Psalms*. Ballston-Spa, 1818, p. 162.

² So strong is partisan prejudice that even in our day a historian of Federal proclivities cannot allude to Barlow without appending some phrase of personal insult. See John Bach McMaster's *History of the People of the United States*, New York, v. d., Vol. II, pp. 146, 399. And in Connecticut, at the time, there is said to have been only one "Jeffersonian Democrat" among the clergy.—*MS. mem. of Rev. R. Manning Chipman*.

³ Todd, *Life and Letters*, p. 161.

Webster, wrote from New Haven, giving Barlow's renunciation of Christianity as his ground for having discontinued friendship.¹ When, finally, in his letter to Gregoire, Barlow answered these charges and asserted his adherence to the faith of his youth, the editor of the *Panoplist* replied, accusing him of insincerity and more than implying that he was an infidel.² When one considers how readily such rumors are absorbed and such charges believed, and remembers that the name of Joel Barlow appeared in very large type upon the title page of the Connecticut Psalm-book, it is not difficult to understand that his revision, not originally welcome for its own sake, grew even heavier in the hands of Connecticut Christians until finally dropped. And it is just as easy to understand how, in course of time, the feeling of hostility toward Barlow's person should become traditionally the sole reason for replacing his revision by one made by President Dwight.³ But the proof that hostility to Barlow was one, at least, of the reasons behind the new revision does not rest wholly on tradition or outside evidence. Very significant is the fact that everything of his, or suggestive of him, is eliminated from Dr. Dwight's revision. No one of his original versions is retained, nor any of the very many changes and amendments introduced by him; and yet some of these were improvements beyond any question.

(4) As regards the participants in this movement to displace

¹Todd, *Life and Letters*, p. 220.

²*The Panoplist*, Vol. III, No. 4, for September, 1810.

³So E. H. Gillett, *History of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America*; Philadelphia, n. d. [1864], Vol. I, p. 292: "This measure was adopted in consequence of the ill odor which Barlow's career in connection with French politics had given to his edition of Watts." So, also, Rev. Oliver E. Daggett, in *The New Englander*, No. XV, for July, 1846, p. 327: "We know not how generally the book was at first adopted, but the compiler soon gave it an ill odor among the good people of Connecticut. . . . he . . . was supposed to have imbibed French irreligion. Such a man's 'praise' could not be 'in all the churches.'" Mr. Daggett was one of the editors of the Connecticut Association's *Psalms and Hymns* of 1848, but as he speaks of the revision of Watts as put in Barlow's hands in 1787, he can hardly be cited as well-informed upon the subject.

Barlow, it has already appeared that New England, outside of Connecticut, was not concerned in it. It was, of course, the project of the Connecticut Association, and apparently unanimously concurred in. Dr. Dwight's book is said to have been adopted by the churches of the State perhaps without exception,¹ and it was used by them for many years.

To what exact extent the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church was concerned in this movement is not easy to determine. There was at the time a desire for some improvement in the authorized psalmody, but apparently it took the direction of craving the addition of suitable hymns. The Connecticut project was reported, recommended by the trusted name of Dr. Dwight. The Association asked the coöperation of the Assembly, backed, doubtless, by a body of sympathizers in the Assembly itself. There was a willingness to wait and see what Dr. Dwight could do, and finally, after some delay, a willingness that such churches as wished should feel free to use his revision. That appears to be all, and after it Barlow's revision occupied just the same position it had held before as an authorized psalm-book, and Watts's *Hymns* are admitted side by side with Dr. Dwight's *Selection*.²

The impression one derives from the whole record of this matter is that the General Assembly as a body was not much moved by the agitation against Barlow,³ nor solicitous for the restoration of Dr. Watts's text, but willing rather to consider and welcome Dr. Dwight's revision on its merits, and incidentally to gratify the Connecticut Association and an element in its own body especially affected by Connecticut influences.

This impression is confirmed by the after history of the two revisions in Presbyterian churches. The remark of Dr. Gillett⁴ concerning Barlow's revision, that "its use in Presbyterian as

¹ O. E. Daggett, in *The New Englander*, No. XV, for July, 1846, p. 328.

² *Minutes*, as already cited.

³ The name of Barlow does not seem to have appeared upon the title of any distinctively Presbyterian edition until introduced, curiously enough, in one of 1799 [C 13], published while Dr. Dwight's revision was in progress.

⁴ *Op. cit.*, Vol. I, p. 292.

well as Congregational churches had become obnoxious," is quite misleading. It continued in wide, and in some sections of the country in practically exclusive, use. In Philadelphia, for example, Dr. James Mease, describing the Presbyterian churches in 1811, reports that "Watts's psalms, improved by Barlow, are generally used in their churches."¹ Editions multiplied, and, as has appeared, "corrected" editions were thought worth while. Dwight's revision never superseded Barlow's in the Presbyterian Church at large. The latter continued in good standing and wide use until the General Assembly adopted its own *Psalms and Hymns* in 1830. And from the report of the committee compiling that book it is plain that among the existing collections used by them, *Dwight* and *Barlow* were considered as on equal footing in the churches.² In both that and the subsequent *Psalms and Hymns* of 1848 appeared many of the then long familiar alterations and additions to the text of Watts, which had been introduced in 1785 by Barlow.³ Dwight's revision was, however, introduced into many Presbyterian churches; though most of these appear to have been in the State of New York and adjacent parts where New England influences were especially operative.

It is probable that we now have before us data from which we may estimate correctly the precise degree and extent of what Mr. Tyler chose to describe as "an ecclesiastical scandal and tragedy."

In regard to the revision itself thus proposed as a substitute for Barlow's, not much needs to be said. If it was to be made at all, the selection of Dr. Dwight to make it was most fitting. The successor of Dr. Stiles as President of Yale, he was held in

¹ *The Picture of Philadelphia*. By James Mease, M. D. Philadelphia: 1811, p. 207.

² Baird's *Collection*, etc. Philadelphia [1855], p. 210.

³ "We observe that a Presbyterian Assembly, which has been jealous of New England innovations, has yet retained in the last collection of Psalms put forth under its sanction many or most of Barlow's alterations, which were long since eschewed in the region where they originated." Rev. O. E. Daggett, in *The New Englander*, No. XV, for July, 1846, p. 327, note.

highest regard throughout Congregational and Presbyterian churches, whose closer union was his special concern. He was also known as a poet, having published his *Conquest of Canaan* in 1785, his *Triumph of Infidelity* in 1788, and his *Greenfield Hill* in 1794.

It is curious to find Dr. Dwight's name on the title-page of the new revision with the same prominence to which Dr. Stiles had objected in the case of Barlow. Dr. Dwight differed from Barlow, as has been seen, in confining the changes from the original to such as seemed essential, and also in appropriating once more several Psalms to the circumstances of this country. His original contributions far exceeded Barlow's in number, numbering in all thirty-three versions, estimated to contain some twelve hundred and fifty lines. As regards the degree of literalness attained in these versions, it is sufficient to remark that the one now best remembered, "I Love Thy Kingdom, Lord," appeared as a version of Psalm CXXXVII.

(3) EDITIONS OF DWIGHT'S REVISION.

The larger number of editions of Dr. Dwight's revision seen by the writer appeared with the allowance of the General Association on the title; a few with that of the General Assembly. They cannot, however, be thus separated into Congregational and Presbyterian groups, as some of the former contain features showing them to have been intended for Presbyterian as well as Congregational use.

The following are the editions at hand:

- [G 2] [Same Title as G 1] Hartford: Printed for Hudson & Goodwin. From Sidney Press. 1803. 16mo.
- [G 3] The Psalms of David, . . . in proper metres. To the Psalms is added A Selection of Hymns. By Timothy Dwight, D. D., President of Yale College. Approved and allowed by the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America. Second Edition. New Brunswick: Printed by A. Blauvelt. 1804. 16mo.

(In addition to the usual certificate of the joint-committee, this edition prefixes an "Extract from The Minutes

of the General-(*sic*) Assembly, A. D. 1802." It was, perhaps, the "second edition" with this title and extract.)

- [G 4] [Same Title as G 1] Albany: Printed and published by Whiting, Backus & Whiting . . . 1804. 16mo.
 [G 5] [Same Title] Hartford: Printed by Hudson & Goodwin. 1811. 24mo.
 [G 6] [Same Title] Same printer: 1814. 24mo.
 [G 7] [Same Title as G 3, but omitting "Second Edition."] Albany: Printed by Websters and Skinners. 1817. 12mo.

(It has the extract from the Minutes of the General Assembly. The copyright notice is of a renewal in Dr. Dwight's name "in the fortieth year of the Independence," etc., of a book having the title as appearing on the title-page of this edition.)

- [G 8] [Same Title as G 1] New York: Published and sold by Charles Starr. 1822. 32mo.
 (The copyright notice is that of G 7.)
 [G 9] [Same Title] Hartford: Printed by P. B. Gleason and Co. . . . 1830. 16mo.

(It has the extract from the Minutes of the General Assembly.)

The writer has seen notices of the following additional editions of Dwight's revision:—

1808. New Haven. 12mo.
 1809. New Haven: J. Seymour & Co. 32mo.
 1812. New Haven. 32mo.
 1814. Hartford. 12mo.
 1816. New York: E. Duyckinck. 32mo.
 1816. New York: Rob. McDermott. 32mo.
 1817. Hartford. 32mo.
 1817. New York: J. L. Tiffany. 12mo.
 1819. Hartford. 12mo.
 1821. New Haven. 12mo.
 1827. New Haven: N. Whiting. 32mo.
 1828. Elizabeth-Town. 32mo.
 1832. New Haven. 32mo.

It will be noted that the several revisions of Watts's *Psalms* studied up to this point form a single series in actual historical connection. Barlow's revision was planned to replace Mycall's, and Dwight's to replace Barlow's, and all find the reason of their existence in the original motive behind Mycall's—the purpose of adapting Watts's local appropriations of the Psalms to free America. This series of revisions, which forms the theme of the present paper, may be said to end with that of Dwight. Later in the nineteenth century there followed another series of editions or “arrangements” of *Watts*, of which those of Winchell, Worcester, and Morse, were the most conspicuous. But these had other motives behind them, among which was the purpose of gathering, and, perhaps, rearranging, the whole of Dr. Watts's contributions to psalmody in one volume.

Intervening, however, between these later editions and the earlier revisions, were two minor revisions of Watts's *Psalms*, distinctively pertaining to the former series, perhaps, rather than to the latter. In either case it seems proper to include some notice of them here, for the sake of discriminating their several issues from those of the earlier revisions, with which they are so easily confused.

V.

THE BOSTON REVISION.

A separate group of editions of Watts's *Psalms* may be referred to as a Boston revision, so many of the type appearing there, especially with the imprint of Manning and Loring. The titles of these have nothing to indicate a revision of any kind. The text is made from the original with the aid principally of the Barlow and Worcester editions. Psalms LX and LXXV present the peculiarities of the Worcester text. Other psalms vary from both that and Barlow's. An ear-mark of these editions is Psalm XXI, C. M., the title of which reads, “Psalm XXI. Com. metre. Altered.” The *Psalms* and *Hymns* are generally bound together.

[H 1] The Psalms of David, Imitated in the Language of the New-Testament, And applied to the Christian State and Worship. By I. Watts, D. D. [two texts.] Boston :

- Printed by Manning & Loring, For Thomas & Andrews, and Manning & Loring. 1803. 12mo.
- [H 2] [Same Title] Same printer. 1808. 16mo.
- [H 3] [Same Title, one text omitted] Boston : Hastings, Etheridge & Bliss. 1808. 16mo.
- [H 4] [Same Title as H 1, with "Isaac" in full] Sutton (Mass.), Sewall Goodridge. 1808. 24mo.
- [H 5] [Same Title as H 1] Boston : Manning & Loring. May 1812. 16mo.
- [H 6] [Same Title] Boston: Lincoln & Edmands. 1813. 32mo.
- [H 7] [Same Title, one text omitted and "Isaac" in full] Rochester : E. Peck & Co. 1822. 48mo.
- [H 8] [Same Title as H 7] Hartford : Judd, Loomis & Co. 1836. 48mo.

It is not unlikely that in the numbers of the series of which these are examples there exist variations of text ; but these are not of particular significance.

VI.

A PRESBYTERIAN REVISION.

There appeared in 1803 a minor revision, of which only one issue has been met with by the writer, and which cannot be identified with any one of those heretofore noted. The title is as follows :

- [I 1] Dr. Watts' Imitation of the Psalms of David, suited to the Christian Worship in the United States. And allowed by the Synod of New York and Philadelphia, to be used in all the churches. [text.] New York : Printed for W. Durrell, No. 106, Maiden-Lane. Deare and Andrews, Printers. 1803. 48mo. (Watts's *Hymns* bound in.)

Published after all the important revisions, the purpose of this seems to be to return as far as possible to the original text of Dr. Watts, as in Psalms XXI and LX, or, when that is impracticable, as in Psalm LXXV, to omit the Psalm altogether. In such alterations as are made, Barlow is preferred to Dwight. None of the original versions supplied by either hand is here included.

In thus bringing to a close this, the first attempt to study the American revisions of Watts's *Psalms*, and to discriminate the editions embodying them, the present writer deems that no apology is necessary for so much labor spent in illustrating such a theme. This is a scientific age; and he believes, for his part, that the collection and classification of old psalm-books, which are the remains and record of the spiritual life of contemporaneous Christians, is just as scientific as the collection and classification of fossil shells, which are the remains and record of the animal life of contemporaneous mollusca. For the limitations and imperfections of the labor itself, he feels more free to apologize. It has not been possible to gather together all the issues of the various revisions, and as long as there is even one outstanding, he is in no position to say that it might not, if known, modify the results of his study of those actually under his hand.

Date Due

~~DEC 2 1957~~

~~MAY 2 1958~~

~~APR 2 1958~~



PRINTED IN U. S. A.

